INTRODUCTION

On March 24, 2011, the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board (Board) issued an Order dismissing four legal contentions in the above-captioned proceeding. Order (Dismissing Contentions), dated March 24, 2011 (Order) (unpublished).1 With respect to the remaining Phase I legal contentions identified by the parties in the joint stipulation,2 the Board stated that the Department of Energy (DOE) or the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff (Staff) “should timely file dispositive motions seeking appropriate relief, such as a motion to dismiss a contention in whole or in part.” Id. at 2.3

On April 8, 2011, DOE filed “U.S. Department of Energy’s Motion to Dismiss NEI Safety Contention 05” (Motion) and on April 16, 2011, filed a supplement to its Motion. See

1 This ruling was based on the Board’s December 14, 2010 Memorandum and Order deciding Phase I Legal Issues and denying rule waiver petitions. U.S. Dep’t of Energy (High-Level Waste), LBP-10-22, 72 NRC ___ (slip op.) (Dec. 14, 2010) (LBP-10-22).


3 The Board noted that the time period prescribed in 10 C.F.R. § 2.323(a) would not apply to such motions. Order at 2 n.8.
Supplement to U.S. Department of Energy’s Motion to Dismiss NEI Safety Contention 05, dated April 16, 2011 (Supplement). For the reasons set forth below, the Board should dismiss NEI-SAFETY-05.

DISCUSSION

NEI-SAFETY-05


The joint statement of the parties, as accepted by the Board, specifies that the threshold legal issues for NEI-SAFETY-05 are: (1) whether 10 C.F.R. §§ 20.1002, 20.1003, 20.1101, 50.40, and 63.111 require As Low As Reasonably Achievable (ALARA) considerations at individual nuclear plant sites remote from the geologic repository operations area (GROA) to be addressed in DOE’s License Application (LA); and (2) whether DOE must demonstrate that the repository not only meets applicable safety and environmental regulatory standards, but must show that it does so without any alleged unnecessary expenditures of resources. Order (Identifying Phase I Legal Issues for Briefing), dated October 23, 2009, at 1; see U.S. Department of Energy, State of Nevada and Nuclear Energy Institute Joint Proposal Identifying Phase 1 Legal Issues for Briefing, dated October 6, 2009, Attachment 1 at 1.

NEI states that the Board’s ruling on Legal Issue 1 does not have any self-executing effect on NEI-SAFETY-05. Nuclear Energy Institute’s Position on Effect of Ruling

---

4 DOE’s Supplement addresses the 10 C.F.R. § 2.323(b) requirement that a motion “include a certification by the attorney or representative of the moving party that the movant has made a sincere effort to contact other parties in the proceeding and resolve the issue(s) raised in the motion, and that the movant’s efforts to resolve the issue(s) have been unsuccessful.” The Staff does not object to DOE’s Motion as supplemented because, as DOE indicated in its supplement, the parties previously conferred regarding the effects of LBP-10-22 on admitted contentions and DOE certified that it had conferred with the Nuclear Energy Institute (NEI) and the Staff regarding the Motion. See Supplement at 1-2.
on Phase I Legal Issue 1, dated January 21, 2011, at 2. NEI acknowledged that the Board’s ruling in LBP-10-22 establishes the law of the case, which affects whether NEI-SAFETY-05 should be dismissed. Id. DOE argues that the Board’s resolution of Legal Issue 1 in LBP-10-22 renders NEI-SAFETY-05 inadmissible as a matter of law. Motion at 2.5

DOE is correct. The Board held that DOE is not required as a matter of law to take into account ALARA considerations outside the GROA. See LBP-10-22 at 9; see NRC Staff Brief on Phase I Legal Issues, dated December 7, 2009, at 4. In addition, the Board ruled that there is no requirement for DOE to demonstrate that the repository meets applicable safety and environmental standards without any unnecessary expenditure of resources. LBP-10-22 at 9. NEI does not argue that its contention raises a factual issue. See Nuclear Energy Institute’s Position on Effect of Ruling on Phase I Legal Issue 1 (NEI-SAFETY-05), dated January 21, 2011, at 1. The assertions and bases provided in NEI-SAFETY-05 are predicated on whether ALARA considerations are required outside of the GROA and whether DOE must demonstrate that the repository not only meets applicable safety and environmental regulatory standards, but must show that it does so without any alleged unnecessary expenditures of resources. See The Nuclear Energy Institute’s Petition to Intervene, dated December 19, 2008, at 31. In the Board’s ruling on Legal Issue 1, the Board precluded such assertions and bases. See LBP-10-22 at 5-9. Accordingly, the factual support in NEI’s contention requires no further consideration in light of the Board’s ruling on the legal issues and the contentions should therefore be dismissed.

5 The parties previously stipulated that the legal issue raised by NEI-SAFETY-05 was resolved by the Board’s resolution of Legal Issue 5 and NEI recognized the contention is susceptible to a summary disposition motion. See Joint Report, Attachment at 1 (citing LBP-10-22 at 9).
CONCLUSION

The Board should grant the Motion and dismiss NEI-SAFETY-05.

Respectfully submitted,

/Signed (electronically) by/

Christopher C. Hair
Counsel for NRC Staff
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
(301) 415-2174
Christopher.Hair@nrc.gov

/Executed in accord with 10 C.F.R. § 2.340(d)/

Jessica A. Bielecki
Counsel for NRC Staff
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15D21
Washington, DC 20555-0001
(301) 415-1391
Jessica.Bielecki@nrc.gov

Dated at Rockville, Maryland
this 18th day of April, 2011
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BEFORE THE ATOMIC SAFETY LICENSING BOARD

In the Matter of

U. S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY
(High-Level Waste Repository)

Docket No.  63-001-HLW
ASLBP No.  09-892-HLW-CAB04

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the “NRC STAFF RESPONSE TO U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY MOTION TO DISMISS NEI SAFETY CONTENTION 05” in the above-captioned proceeding have been served on the following persons this 18th day of April, 2011, by Electronic Information Exchange.

CAB 04
Thomas S. Moore, Chairman
Paul S. Ryerson
Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: tsm2@nrc.gov

Martin G. Malsch, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick & Malsch, PLLC
1750 K Street, N.W. Suite 350
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com

CAB 04
Paul S. Ryerson
Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: tsm2@nrc.gov

psr1@nrc.gov
rew@nrc.gov

Office of the Secretary
ATTN: Docketing and Service
Mail Stop: O-16C1
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555
E-mail: HEARINGDOCKET@nrc.gov

Brian W. Hembacher, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
California Attorney General’s Office
300 South Spring Street
Los Angeles, CA 90013
E-mail: brian.hembacher@doj.ca.gov

CAB 04
Martin G. Malsch, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick & Malsch, PLLC
1750 K Street, N.W. Suite 350
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com

CAB 04
Martin G. Malsch, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick & Malsch, PLLC
1750 K Street, N.W. Suite 350
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com

Office of Commission Appellate
Adjudication
ocaamail@nrc.gov

Timothy E. Sullivan, Esq.
Deputy Attorney General
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street. 20th Flr.
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
E-mail: timothy.sullivan@doj.ca.gov

CAB 04
Martin G. Malsch, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick & Malsch, PLLC
1750 K Street, N.W. Suite 350
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com

Kevin W. Bell, Esq.
Senior Staff Counsel
California Energy Commission
1516 9th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: kwbell@energy.state.ca.us

Charles J. Fitzpatrick, Esq.
John W. Lawrence, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick, Malsch & Lawrence PLLC
1777 N.E. Loop 410, Suite 600
San Antonio, TX 78217
E-mail: cfitzpatrick@nuclearlawyer.com
jlawrence@nuclearlawyer.com

Kevin W. Bell, Esq.
Senior Staff Counsel
California Energy Commission
1516 9th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: kwbell@energy.state.ca.us

CAB 04
Martin G. Malsch, Esq.
Egan, Fitzpatrick & Malsch, PLLC
1750 K Street, N.W. Suite 350
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: mmalsch@nuclearlawyer.com

Kevin W. Bell, Esq.
Senior Staff Counsel
California Energy Commission
1516 9th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: kwbell@energy.state.ca.us

Kevin W. Bell, Esq.
Senior Staff Counsel
California Energy Commission
1516 9th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: kwbell@energy.state.ca.us

Kevin W. Bell, Esq.
Senior Staff Counsel
California Energy Commission
1516 9th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail: kwbell@energy.state.ca.us
Shane Thin Elk
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan, LLP
3610 North 163rd Plaza
Omaha, Nebraska 68116
E-mail: sthinelk@ndnlaw.com

Ellen C. Ginsberg
Michael A. Bauser
Anne W. Cottingham
Nuclear Energy Institute, Inc.
1776 I Street, N.W., Suite 400
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: ecg@nei.org
   mab@nei.org
   awc@nei.org

David A. Repka
William A. Horin
Rachel Miras-Wilson
Winston & Strawn LLP
1700 K Street N.W.
Washington, DC 20006
E-mail: drepka@winston.com
   whorin@winston.com
   rwilson@winston.com

Jay E. Silberg
Timothy J.V. Walsh
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP
2300 N Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20037-1122
E-mail: jay.silberg@pillsburylaw.com
   timothy.walsh@pillsburylaw.com

Gregory L. James
712 Owens Gorge Road
HC 79, Box 11
Mammoth Lakes, California 93546
Email: gljames@earthlink.net

Arthur J. Harrington
Godfrey & Kahn, S.C.
780 N. Water Street
Milwaukee, WI 53202
E-mail: aharring@gklaw.com

Steven A. Heinzen
Douglas M. Poland
Hannah L. Renfro
Godfrey & Kahn, S.C.
One East Main Street, Suite 500
P.O. Box 2719
Madison, WI 53701-2719
E-mail: sheinzen@gklaw.com
   dpoland@gklaw.com
   hrenfro@gklaw.com

Robert F. List, Esq.
Jennifer A. Gores, Esq.
Armstrong Teasdale LLP
1975 Village Center Circle, Suite 140
Las Vegas, NV 89134-6237
E-mail: rlist@armstrongteasdale.com
   jgores@armstrongteasdale.com

Diane Curran
Harmon, Curran, Spielberg, & Eisenberg, L.L.P.
1726 M Street N.W., Suite 600
Washington, DC 20036
E-mail: dcurran@harmoncurran.com

Ian Zabarte, Board Member
Native Community Action Council
P.O. Box 140
Baker, NV 89311
E-mail: mrizabarte@gmail.com
Richard Sears  
District Attorney No. 5489  
White Pine County District Attorney’s Office  
311 Murry Street  
Ely, NV 89301  
E-mail: rwsears@me.com

Donald P. Irwin  
Michael R. Shebelskie  
Kelly L. Faglioni  
Hunton & Williams LLP  
Riverfront Plaza, East Tower  
951 East Byrd Street  
Richmond, VA 23219-4074  
E-mail: dirwin@hunton.com  
mshebelskie@hunton.com  
kfaglioni@hunton.com

Curtis G. Berkey  
Scott W. Williams  
Rovianne A. Leigh  
Alexander, Berkey, Williams, & Weathers LLP  
2030 Addison Street, Suite 410  
Berkley, CA 94704  
E-mail: cberkey@abwwlaw.com  
swilliams@abwwlaw.com  
rleigh@abwwlaw.com

Bret O. Whipple  
1100 South Tenth Street  
Las Vegas, Nevada 89104  
E-mail: bretwhipple@nomademail.com

Gregory Barlow  
P.O. Box 60  
Pioche, Nevada 89043  
E-mail: lcda@lcturbonet.com

Michael L. Dunning  
Andrew A. Fitz  
H. Lee Overton  
Jonathan C. Thompson  
Todd R. Bowers  
State of Washington  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 40117  
Olympia, WA 98504-0117  
E-mail: MichaelD@atg.wa.gov  
AndyF@atg.wa.gov  
LeeO1@atg.wa.gov  
JonaT@atg.wa.gov  
toddb@atg.wa.gov

Thomas R. Gottshall  
S. Ross Shealy  
Haynesworth Sinkler Boyd, PA  
1201 Main Street, Suite 2200  
Post Office Box 11889  
Columbia, SC 29211-1889  
E-mail: tgottshall@hsblawfirm.com  
rshealy@hsblawfirm.com

Connie Simkins  
P.O. Box 1068  
Caliente, Nevada 89008  
E-mail: jcciac@co.lincoln.nv.us

Kenneth P. Woodington  
Davidson & Lindemann, P.A.  
1611 Devonshire Drive  
P.O. Box 8568  
Columbia, SC 29202  
E-mail: kwoodington@dml-law.com

Dr. Mike Baughman  
Intertech Services Corporation  
P.O. Box 2008  
Carson City, Nevada 89702  
E-mail: bigboff@aol.com
Michael Berger  
Robert S. Hanna  
Attorney for the County of Inyo  
233 East Carrillo Street Suite B  
Santa Barbara, California 93101  
E-mail: mberger@bsqlaw.net  
rshanna@bsqlaw.net

Don L. Keskey  
Public Law Resource Center PLLC  
505 N. Capitol Avenue  
Lansing, MI 48933  
E-mail: donkeskey@publiclawresourcenter.com

Philip R. Mahowald  
Prairie Island Indian Community  
5636 Sturgeon Lake Road  
Welch, MN 55089  
E-mail: pmahowald@piic.org

James Bradford Ramsay  
National Association of Regulatory Utility Commissioners  
1101 Vermont Avenue NW, Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20005  
E-mail: jramsay@naruc.org

/Signed (electronically) by/
Christopher C. Hair  
Counsel for the NRC Staff  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Office of the General Counsel  
Mail Stop O-15D21  
Washington, DC 20555-0001  
(301) 415-2174  
Christopher.Hair@nrc.gov